

International Journal of Advances in Scientific Research and Engineering (ijasre)

DOI: <u>10.31695/IJASRE.2022.8.2.18</u>

Volume 8, Issue 2 February - 2022

E-ISSN: 2454-8006

Study of Management of Village - Owned Business Entities at Malang of Indonesia

(Implementation of Village Owned Enterprise Management Policy in Turen District, Malang Regency)

Albertus Aliandu Dadu Wodon, Budhy Prianto, and Sukardi

University of Merdeka Malang, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

The management of the Kertoraharjo Village-Owned Enterprises in Sanankerto Village, Turen District, Malang Regency is an effort to realize village independence through the management of business units that bring economic benefits. This Village-Owned Enterprises or commonly called Bumdes has successfully transformed quickly with a significant contribution to the Village Original Income. However, the success of Bumdes Kertoraharjo still encountered some fundamental problems, such as the problem of the quality of human resources for implementing Bumdes operations and the benefits of all village communities have not felt. The research method used is descriptive qualitative survey to provide a comprehensive description related to the Management of Kertoraharjo Village Owned Enterprises and describe the problems that hinder the management of Bumdes. Data collection techniques used are observation, interviews, and documentation. Bumdes Kertoraharjo cooperates with several stakeholders in the management of bumdes, namely Bank BNI and universities, for business unit development and human resource development. Bumdes also optimizes existing potentials to be developed into new business units. Vertical coordination is also routinely carried out through the Office of Community and Village Empowerment, both from the Regency and Province. The delegation of authority for the Bumdes implementing apparatus has been structured but not balanced with sound capabilities. The solution offered to overcome problems in the management of Bumdes Kertoharjo is to increase efforts to develop human resources by cooperating with several educational institutions that focus on the main tasks and functions of each implementing apparatus of Bumdes.

Keywords: Implementation, Management, Village Owned Enterprises.

1. INTRODUCTION

The administration of government in Indonesia today has adopted a decentralized system, in which each region has autonomous authority, which has been regulated in-laws and regulations. The current implementation of regional autonomy appears in the provincial and district/city governments, but the principle of implementing freedom has also been attached to the village government. Along with the enactment of Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages, the Village currently has the authority to regulate and manage government affairs, the local community's interests based on community initiatives, origin rights, and traditional rights that are recognized respected in the government system—the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia.

The main objective of the governance process is oriented towards improving the welfare of the community as a whole. As the lowest governance unit, the Village is the spearhead of the successful development of a country. The implementation of village government must contribute to improving the quality of life and welfare of the village community as a whole. Law no. 6 of 2014 concerning Villages also gives a new color in village governance that is more dynamic and flexible. The meaning of active and relaxed is more visible, like autonomy inherent in the current era of village government. In the law on the Village, several fundamental things have been contained that make the current administration of village government different from the previous era.

One of the village government's efforts to realize the welfare of the village community as a whole is through the establishment of a Village Owned Enterprise. Article 87 of Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages states that a Village-Owned Enterprise is an organization that runs a business in the economic field and public services managed in a spirit of kinship and Cooperation oriented towards the Village's welfare community. Technically, management Village-Owned Enterprises must be implemented by the village government and the community to be involved in its direction. The establishment of Village Owned Enterprises is one

of the steps chosen in village development because the existence of Bumdes is expected to be able to answer various social inequalities that occur in society,

After the issuance of Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages, one of the articles talking about Village-Owned Enterprises, the Ministry of Villages for Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration also issued regulations as a derivative of the law, namely Permendes PDTT Number 4 of 2015 concerning the establishment, management of and management, and dissolution of Village-Owned Enterprises. In Permendes PDTT Number 4 of 2015, Bumdes is a business entity whose capital is wholly or mainly owned by the Village through direct participation from village assets, which are separated to manage assets, services, and other businesses for the most excellent welfare of the Village community. In addition to containing the definition, the ministerial regulation also regulates quite a several things regarding the existence of Bumdes,

By referring to existing laws and regulations, every Village in Indonesia must have a business entity that can provide profits for the community and the village government itself. In Malang Regency, East Java, village-owned enterprises are pretty good. To give the principle of legal standing on the administration of village governance, the Malang Regency Government-issued Regional Regulation no. 1 of 2016 concerning Villages, wherein the legal product, one part of which regulates the existence Village-Owned Enterprises. Currently, the Village government is asked to start innovating, one of which is through the development and management of Village-Owned Enterprises.

Sanankerto Village, Turen District, Malang Regency established a Village Owned Enterprise called Bumdes Kertoraharjo. The purpose of establishing this institution is to reduce the unemployment rate through the creation of business opportunities for the community and an effort to increase the original village income source. Establishing Bumdesa Kertoraharjo involves all elements of the community in Sanankerto Village. This institution was established in 2016, legally stated in the Sanankerto Village Regulation No. 6 of 2020 concerning Amendments to Village Regulation Number 1 of 2015 concerning the Establishment, Management, and Management of Village Owned Enterprises. In this legal product, various types of Bumdes management systems have been regulated, starting from the purpose of establishment, classification of business units, capital,

The purpose of this study is as follows to analyze the management of business entities owned by Kertoraharjo Village based on Sanankerto Village Regulation No. 6 of 2020 concerning Amendments to Village Regulation Number 1 of 2015 concerning the Establishment, Management and Management of Village-Owned Enterprises in Sanankerto Village, Turen District, Malang Regency, and to explain what affects the management of business entities owned by Kertoraharjo Village based on Sanankerto Village Regulation No. 6 of 2020 concerning Amendments to Village Regulation Number 1 of 2015 concerning the Establishment, Managemen and Management of Village-Owned Enterprises in Sanankerto Village, Turen District, Malang Regency.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

Public Policy is one component in the administration of government that utilizes the facilities and infrastructure created by an organization for implementation to achieve goals to the general public by considering the inhibiting and supporting factors. ^[1]states that public policies are made by state administrators and are related to every rule of the game in everyday life, both about relations between citizens and between citizens and the government.

Public Policy in the practice of state administration and governance is basically divided into three principles, namely first, in the context of formulating public policy, second, how public policy is implemented, and thirdly how public Policy is evaluated^[2].

Public Policy has many points of view expressed by experts. In a broad sense, public Policy has two main aspects: public Policy as a social practice and public Policy to resolve conflict. Policy as a social practice is defined as an effort to fight for the interests and needs of the community, while as a conflict resolution-oriented policy, it is intended to generate consensus for overcoming existing problems^[3].

Based on another understanding, public policy, according to^[4], is defined as everything the government chooses to do and not to do. This definition emphasizes that public policy is about the realization of "action" and not is a mere statement of the will of the government or public official. In addition, the government's choice not to do something is also a public policy because it has the same effect as the government's choice to do something.

^[5]also expressed his public policy views. According to him, public policy is owned by an authority in the political system of a country who can legally do something to its people, and the government's choice to do something or not to do something is manifested in the form of allocating values. Involved in the day-to-day affairs of the political system and have responsibilities in

some issues where they are asked to make decisions that are later accepted and bind most members of society for a certain period^[12].

From the several explanations of the definition of public policy, it can be concluded that public policy is a series of interrelated choices that the government has chosen to formulate to implement to solve general problems. The Policy to do something is usually stated in the provisions of laws and regulations made by the government to have a binding and coercive nature.

The purpose of public policy can be distinguished in terms of resources or resources, namely, public Policy aimed at distributing state resources to absorb state resources^[1]. Public Policy, in terms of its characteristics, consists of several types. According to^[6], grouping public policies in several kinds, namely Substantive and Procedural Policies, Distributive, Redistributive, and Regulatory Policies, Material Policies, and general goods policies and private goods policies.

Public policymaking is based on specific models. One of the models used in public policymaking is a process model based on a political approach. According to [6], the process model helps help to understand the various activities involved in the policymaking process. The policy process consists of the following.

Identification of problems of policy problems through demands from individuals or groups for government activities. Agenda setting. The attention of the mass media and public officials on public issues in particular to decide the things that will be selected.

Formulation of policy proposals determination of the problem agenda and program proposals for problem-solving. Policy legitimacy. Vote for a recommendation, establish political support for the proposal, and pass it as a law.

Policy implementation of policies through organizing the bureaucracy, preparing to finance or providing services, collecting taxes, etc. Policy evaluation it analyzes the program, evaluates its results and effects, and suggests changes and adjustments.

Mazmanian and Sabatier Model Policy Implementation, is the implementation analysis, Framework model. ^[7]describes the implementation process, including three main variables: independent variables, intervening variables, and dependent variables.

First, the independent variable, namely whether or not the problem is easy to control, about indicators of theoretical and technical implementation problems, diversity of objects, and desired changes. Second, intervening variables, namely the ability of policies to structure the implementation process with indicators of clarity and consistency of objectives, use of causal theory, the accuracy of allocation of sources of funds, hierarchical integration between implementing agencies, implementing regulations from implementing agencies, recruitment of implementing officials and openness to outside parties, as well as variables outside of policies that affect the implementation process about indicators of socio-economic and technological conditions, public support, constituent attitudes, support from higher officials, and commitment and quality of leadership from implementing officials.

Third, the dependent variable, namely the stages in the implementation process with five settings, namely understanding from the implementing agency or agency in the form of implementing policies, object compliance, tangible results, acceptance of these actual results, and finally leading to a revision of the policies made and implemented or the whole Policy. which is basic.

3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Research is conducted to understand the phenomenon that occurs in an object, in which the process of conducting research must be based on the concept of good and correct research methods [11]. This type of research is descriptive research through a qualitative approach by describing the commitment of the Sanankerto Village government in optimizing the management of village-owned enterprises to improve the welfare of the village community.

The determination of the scope of the research is intended so that the discussion in this study does not go out and widen from the substance to be achieved. With the determination of the scope, the researcher can easily understand the data collection. So, in this study, the size is only limited to implementing policies for the management of bumdes Kertoraharjo, Sanankerto Village, Turen District, Malang Regency based on Sanankerto Village Regulation No. 5 of 2016 concerning the Establishment, Management and Management of Bumdesa Turen District, Malang Regency.

In this study, the research subjects include: The Sanankerto Village Government is in charge of the Kertoraharjo Village-Owned Enterprises; Malang Regency Community and Village Empowerment Service; The operational executor of Bumdes Kertoraharjo; MSME actors around Bumdes business units.

In this study, the informants assigned to extract data and information are: President Director of Kertoraharjo Village-Owned Enterprises; Director of Personnel for Village Owned Enterprises Kertoraharjo; Director of Business Development and Business

Development of Village-Owned Enterprises Kertoraharjo; Director of Administration and Marketing of Village Owned Enterprises Kertoraharjo; Director of Finance for Village Owned Enterprises Kertoraharjo

Observation is a systematic observation and recording of the elements that appear in a symptom or symptoms on the research object^[8]. About this research, the researcher will use data collection techniques with observation because it relates to the activities of the actors, as well as data collection to be sought regarding the work process Implementation of village-owned enterprises management policies based on Village Regulation Number 6 of 2020 concerning Amendments to Village Regulations Number 1 of 2015 concerning the Establishment, Management and Management of Village Owned Enterprises. In conducting observations, the researcher will go directly to the research location to now observe the business units in Bumdes,

Interviews are data collection techniques carried out through dialogue or question and answer with trusted sources to explore problems more profoundly and comprehensively [9]. Interviews can also provide a complete picture and understanding of data or documents that have not been identified. It can be adequately understood.

Data analysis is a process that must be passed after the researcher finishes conducting research in the field. The process that must be given after the implementation of the study is organizing the data based on patterns, categories, and units to be arranged to further formulate hypotheses from the research that has been carried out. The data analysis used in this research is qualitative. This research is descriptive qualitative research, so the data analysis technique used is the data analysis proposed^[10].

4. RESEARCH FINDINGS

Kertoraharjo Bumdes Business Type and Classification. The Kertoraharjo Village-Owned Enterprise is an institution formed to carry out economic business by utilizing the potential that exists in Sanankerto Village. In articles 11 to 16 of the Sanankerto Village Regulation Number 6 of 2020, it is explained that Bumdes can run businesses which include social companies, rental companies, service businesses, trading activities, financial businesses, and joint ventures.

From the business classification outlined in the regulation, Kertoraharjo Village-Owned Enterprises currently have 6 (six) business units, consisting of Boonpring Ecotourism, Grocery Food, Agent 46 Multi-Business Cooperative, Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises, and Event Organizer. The following is the statement from the Director of Bumdes, Mr. Drs. Syamsul Arifin, M.Sc.

"In addition to considering the potential of the existing Village, forming our business units refers to the Perdes. There are several business groupings suggested by the village council to be included. But that doesn't mean that all of the classifications are made entirely; we haven't created a business unit for several types of business. For example, we have not created a team for the holding business, nor have we started a trading business. But it is possible that if the units have developed well, we may open other companies explained in the village regulation."

In the future, Bumdes Kertoraharjo plans to develop new business units, of course, based on the potentials contained in Sanankerto Village. There are 4 (four) new business units whose establishment is planned. Technical and administrative matters have been prepared for its establishment. Based on the statement submitted by the Director of Bumdes Kertoraharjo, Mr. Samsul Arifin, M.Si, the development of new business units is to realize the existence of a sustainable Bumdes. The following is an excerpt of the interview.

"We feel that some of the potentials in this Village have not been developed properly. So through this bumdes, we are trying to develop it in a new bumdes business unit. We have prepared several things, including the waste processing unit, bottled mineral water, bamboo arboretum, and Cooperation with the East Java fisheries service for fish bank educational tours. All preparations have been made, both in terms of budget and assistance from academics."

Bumdes Kertoraharjo plans to develop 4 (four) new business units. The first is the Organic Waste management unit. The development of this unit is based on environmental problems surrounding the Boonpring Ecoswisata unit. The high level of visits in the business unit affects the amount of waste piled up. These ecological problems eventually became the forerunner to develop an organic waste management business unit. To support the capacity of Bumdes in implementing waste management, Bumdes has also collaborated with the Malang Agricultural Development Polytechnic to guide the apparatus that will later be responsible for managing the unit. Later, the sources of waste that will be collected, not only from Ecotourism,

The following business unit to be developed is the manufacture of bottled mineral water. The potential availability of abundant springs is the main reason for developing this business unit. The University of Muhammadiyah Malang is interested in developing this unit, so the institution offered to collaborate in creating the production of bottled mineral water.

Bumdes will also develop a bamboo species educational tourism business unit, where the potential of the Sanankerto Village bamboo forest will be modified into an educational tourism destination. Udayana University and the Indonesian Institute of Sciences cooperated with this development plan. The last one is developing the Fish Bank Educational Tourism business unit in collaboration with the Fisheries Service of East Java Province for breeding affairs.

Bumdes Kertoraharjo has been able to explore again the potentials of villages that can be used as new business units in Bumdes. It is undeniable that of the four types of new businesses that will be opened, Bumdes always cooperates with professional parties who have knowledge skills to be applied to develop these business units. Apart from being supported by an adequate budget, the story of new business units must also be supported by the availability of qualified human resources, both from the Bumdes internal and external parties.

Bumdes Kertoraharjo Cooperation with Stakeholders, In managing Village-Owned Enterprises, Cooperation with various parties is an essential aspect for strengthening the capacity of Bumdes. The management of Village Owned Enterprises is expected to be carried out sustainably. Therefore, Bumdes must collaborate with several stakeholders for better quality management. Law Number 6 of 2014 article 93 paragraph (1) states that Village cooperation with third parties is carried out to accelerate and improve Village Government's implementation, Village Development, Village community development, and Village community empowerment. And in article 93, paragraph (2), Cooperation with third parties as referred to in paragraph (2) is discussed in the Village Deliberation.

From its inception until it is included in the management, Bumdes Kertoraharjo has collaborated with several stakeholders, both from BUMN and universities. The Cooperation that has been established is related to the fulfillment of capital aspects and aspects of fulfilling the fundamental needs of Bumdes.

Bumdes Cooperation with Bank Negara Indonesia

The partnership between Bumdes Kertoraharjo and Bank Negara Indonesia was established in 2017. Bumdes Kertoraharjo was established in 2016 with initial capital participation from the Village Fund. After being found and forming a committee, this Bumdes did not develop, resulting in a vacuum of activity in the first year.

Entered in 2017, then a new Bumdes board was formed. Carrying the spirit of change, Bumdes Kertororaharjo is reactivated; access to capital comes from the Village Fund and through capital participation obtained from Bank Negara Indonesia (BNI).

The presence of BNI in mentoring and managing Bumdes Kertoraharjo is a form of implementation of the MoU that was established with the Ministry of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions, and Transmigration in 2016. Based on the MoU, BNI then partnered with many Bumdes in Indonesia, one of which was Bumdes Kertoraharjo. In this regard, BNI provided initial capital participation to Bumdes Kertoraharjo, amounting to Rp 438,000,000.

In addition to providing equity participation, BNI also facilitated the opening of 46 agents, which functioned to serve all types of public finance transactions. Agent 46 is used as one of the Bumdes business units, and its management is handed over directly to Bumdes. This was confirmed by the Director of Bumdes Kertoraharjo, Drs. Samsul Arifin M.Si. Here's his statement.

"The Cooperation with Bank BNI as a working partner in our effort to fulfill capital adequacy. If we only rely on the Village Fund, that's impossible. The first one is the focus is on BNI; we get CSR funds of Rp. 438,000,000, that's in late 2017. We directly use the funds for the development of Boonpring ecotourism, as well as the Micro Hydro Power Plant in it."

> Bumdes Kertoraharjo Cooperation with Universities

As we know, in realizing an organization that understands science and technology, it is necessary to build a constructive relationship with universities as institutions or institutions considered competent in the development of science. Village-Owned Enterprises, a village economic institution that empowers so many resources, also need to get a touch from educational institutions so that the management process can be structured and systematic.

To strengthen the capacity of Bumdes Kertoraharjo, Bumdes collaborated with several universities to provide technical guidance on various aspects of the management being carried out. Since its inception, Bumdes has collaborated with several universities, namely the University of Muhammadiyah Malang, Malang State Polytechnic, Udayana University Denpasar, Sepuluh Nopember Institute of Technology Surabaya, Kanjuruhan University Malang, Malang Agricultural Development Polytechnic, and the Indonesian Institute of Sciences.

The collaboration with several educational institutions is influenced by the inability of the implementers/apparatuses to develop the existing potentials and the lack of ability to manage Bumdes technically. Recognizing the current limitations, Bumdes initiates

Cooperation with these institutions, according to what portion and needs they want. This condition was conveyed by the Director of Bumdes Kertoraharjo, Drs. Samsul Arifin, M.Sc. The following is an excerpt of his statement.

"So this is it, man; why do we need to cooperate with universities? There are several important aspects that we need knowledge and assistance with. You should know that we cooperate with this university according to what we need in the field. One example is LIPI. We realize that we have the potential of a bamboo icon that must be raised, and LIPI has the expertise in guiding us to develop a bamboo arboretum. Then ITS collaborated to provide our understanding about membranes or raise new potentials, the term Bumdes class promotion. Continue to polynema; they give us technical guidance to improve the quality of our employees' human resources."

From this explanation, it can be explained that the strengthening of the capacity of Bumdes from various aspects should be carried out on an ongoing basis. The Bumdes management is responsible for that; the decision to cooperate with educational institutions is the right solution. Thus, the management and implementing apparatus of Bumdes must also be responsible for mastering the knowledge provided so that it can be appropriately applied.

Educational institutions that facilitate capacity building for Bumdes Kertororaharjo are responsible for providing guidance and training to all elements within the Bumdes. In addition to the several institutions mentioned in the interview excerpt from the Director of Bumdes, other institutions also contributed to their knowledge.

In Cooperation with the Merdeka University of Malang, the institution's duties and functions are to provide direction to the Bumdes management regarding planning arrangements (*master plan*) Boonpring ecotourism business unit. Furthermore, Udayana University Denpasar also contributed to research on bamboo species and taxonomy, similar to what was done by LIPI. Then, there is the Malang Agricultural Development Polytechnic which facilitates Bumdes for education on organic waste management, the University of Muhammadiyah Malang in the context of the construction of a Micro Hydro Power Plant, and the Kanjuruhan University of Malang, which facilitates technical guidance for the opening of a Multipurpose Cooperative unit.

The potentials possessed by the Sanankerto Village, further developed in the Bumdes, need to be assisted by competent institutions. Some possibilities have their level of difficulty to be set, so it is not possible to manage the existing human resource capabilities.

About the policy objectives for managing the Kertoraharjo Village-Owned Enterprises, this Bumdes focuses on community participation and strengthening the management apparatus's capacity and contribution to Village Original Income. In articles 6 and 7 of the Sanankerto Village Regulation Number 6 of 2020 concerning Amendments to Village Regulation Number 1 of 2015, it is clearly stated that Bumdes was formed to accommodate community creativity that has economic value so that it can be developed into Bumdes business units. Thus, the community can be directly involved in the village development process through their efforts to contribute to increasing Village Original Income while at the same time providing progress to their respective socio-economic lives. In an interview with the Director of Bumdes, Drs. Syamsul Arifin, M.Si, the following is his statement.

"We have to see the orientation of this bumdes—economic advantage. But there are urgent matters that we need to pay close attention to. It's useless if our contribution to PADes is big, but the people involved don't feel the impact either. The impact on the community's welfare is important. Therefore, we maximize community participation. The presence of Bumdes will open up business media in supporting the community's economy according to the potential we have."

The target in the Kertoraharjo Bumdes management policy is the Sanankerto Village community, which participates in the dynamics of the Bumdes. The policy targets in question are related to operational implementers and refer to the impact of Bumdes on socio-economic changes in the community. The business unit that can attract community participation is the Boonpring ecotourism unit based on field observations. In this unit, Bumdes facilitates the local community by providing business stalls for people who want to become entrepreneurs.

5. CONCLUSION

Based on the description and explanation in the discussion section of the study entitled Management of Village-Owned Enterprises (Study on Implementation of Policy on Management of Village-Owned Enterprises Based on Village Regulation Number 6 of 2020 concerning Amendments to Village Regulation Number 1 of 2015 concerning Establishment, Management and Management of Owned Enterprises Village in Sanankerto Village, Turen District, Malang Regency), it can be concluded as follows.

- ➤ Based on Village Regulation Number 6 of 2020 concerning Amendments to Village Regulation Number 1 of 2015 concerning the Establishment, Management and Management of Village-Owned Enterprises, several classifications of Bumdes business are described, consisting of social interaction, leasing, service business, trade, finance, and joint venture. Currently, the business units managed by Bumdes Kertoraharjo are classified as social business businesses whose orientation is for economic gain and community empowerment.
- > Bumdes Cooperation with stakeholders that Bumdes Kertoraharjo forges with Bank Negara Indonesia and universities is one form of management strategy so that Bumdes gets financial support and mastery of science.
- ➤ Hierarchically, Kertoraharjo Village-Owned Enterprises receive direct guidance from the Regional Government through the Community and Village Empowerment Office, both in the Regency and the Province.
- ➤ The main target of managing Kertoraharjo Village Owned Enterprises is to increase community welfare and contribute to the Sanankerto Village Original Income.
- ➤ Bumdes Kertoraharjo is supported by the availability of human resources and budgetary resources. It is sufficient for human resources but not yet satisfactory in quality.
- > The management of Kertoraharjo Village-Owned Enterprises is carried out by operational executives (principal director, director of business development and development, Director of Personnel, Director of Administration and Marketing, and director of finance). The description of duties and authorities has been regulated in the Articles of Association and Bylaws of Bumdes Kertoraharjo.

The management of Bumdes business units does not refer to the Standard Operational Procedure of the business unit, but all business units are guided by the Village Regulation and AD/ART. Meanwhile, the management of Bumdes by operational implementers is accountable to the commissioner who.

REFERENCES

- 1. Dwidjowijoto, Riant Nugroho. 2006. Public Policy of Developing Countries. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- 2. Uddin and Sobirin. 2017. Public Policy. Makassar: CV Sah Media.
- 3. Thoha, Miftah. 2014. Contemporary Public Administration Science. Jakarta: Prenada Media Group.
- 4. Islam, M. Irfan. 2009. Public Policy. Jakarta: Open University
- 5. Augustino, Leo. 2009. Fundamentals of Public Policy. Bandung: Alphabeta
- 6. Anggara, Sahya. 2018. Public Policy. Bandung: CV Librarian Setia
- 7. Handoyo, Eko. 2012. Public Policy. Semarang: Widya Karya.
- 8. Nawawi and Martini. 1992. Social Research Instruments. Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada Press.
- 9. Sugiyono. 2010. Educational Research Methods Quantitative Qualitative Approach and R&D. Bandung: Alphabeta
- 10. Miles and Huberman. 1992. Qualitative Data Analysis. Jakarta: UIP.
- 11. Nafi, M., Supriadi, B., & Roedjinandari, N. (2018). Internal Marketing Impact On External Service Quality In Semeru Pine Forest (Spf) Tourist Attraction. IOSR Journal of Business and Management (IOSR-JBM), 20(7), 66–72. https://doi.org/10.9790/487X-2007016672
- 12. Intan, D., Sari, P., Widjajani, R., & Noor, T. (2022). Implementation Of E-Government In Improving Public Service: The Policy of the Directorate General of Taxes at the South Malang , in Indonesia. 8(2), 42–46. https://doi.org/10.31695/IJASRE.2022.8.2.6